



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

AND UNIVERSALLY ACKNOWLEDGED;" and the Rev. Dr. Murray, in his evidence before the Committee of the House of Commons, in answer to a question, enumerates, among others, this book as containing "the most authentic exposition of the faith of the [Roman] Catholic Church."

I am, sir, your obedient servant,
London, Feb., 1858. C. H. COLLETTE.

"THIS IS MY BODY."

TO THE EDITOR OF THE CATHOLIC LAYMAN.

SIR,—I do not think it is sufficiently considered in the controversy as to the meaning of these words, what I may say *must* have been their import to the Apostles themselves. Romanists, arguing from their plain literal meaning, ought not to lose sight of the sense in which, as it appears to us, the Apostles *must* have understood them. Let us consider facts. The Apostles eat what was given to them; and after they had sung an hymn they went out into the Mount of Olives. If the Romish doctrine be true, each portion of bread was transubstantiated into Christ's flesh and blood, body, soul, and divinity; so that, whilst he continued to sit opposite to them at table, he was really, at the same time, corporally and locally in each of their stomachs. This is startling enough. But consider further. It is into Christ's *slain* body that the bread must be supposed to be transubstantiated, according to our Lord's words—"This is my body, which is broken for you," and "this is my blood, which is shed for many." But how could what the Apostles eat be Christ's slain body, when His slain body did not then actually exist? If it was already slain, then our redemption had been completed without Christ's sufferings and death upon the cross. But if a slain body had as yet no existence, how could bread be changed into it? I may be told of God's omnipotence, and that all things are possible to him. And so, doubtless, are all things that are possible in themselves. But it is no more derogatory to His perfections that He cannot perform contradictions than that He cannot do wrong, annihilate Himself, or make one of His creatures greater than Himself. Now, it is a contradiction in terms to say that a solid body is locally in two places at once. And it is also a contradiction to assert that anything exists and does not exist at the same time.

Let Romanists look their doctrine plainly in the face. They must maintain either of two hypotheses. The Apostles, after receiving, carried about in their stomachs, each of them, a corporal body of their Master, who still walked beside them; and that a slain body, though no such thing existed for at least twelve hours afterwards. If they reject this theory, then the words, "this is my body," if they have a transubstantiating effect now, which they had not when addressed to the Apostles, have it not from any necessity for their being understood in their plain, literal sense.

It satisfies us, members of this Reformed Church, to understand these words in the only sense in which we conceive it possible for them to have been addressed to the Apostles; in whatever sense the bread and wine were to the Apostles the body and blood of Christ, we are content to receive them only in the same sense. It suffices us to feed on Him in no other manner than they did. We will not believe that we have eaten Christ's material body, unless it be granted that the Apostles did so likewise. He still sitting opposite to them at table. Neither will we believe that we receive His solid body slain, unless it be conceded that His Apostles partook of His slain body twelve hours before the fact of His death was accomplished.

Of course, there is nothing new in all this, nor, indeed, can there well be in anything connected with so long vexed a question. But still it may not be useless to recall attention to points which, after being fully canvassed at former periods of the Church, have been laid aside, as if no more light could be thrown upon them. I do not recollect seeing the matter put in this way of late, and, therefore, I have troubled you with a few lines on the subject.

Your obedient servant,
C. C.

THE HOLY FATHERS ACKNOWLEDGE THE SUPREMACY OF ST. PETER; AND THAT THE CHURCH OR THE FOUNDATION NEVER FAILS.

[This letter is so long, and the authorities referred to so numerous, that we are reluctantly obliged to divide it, and postpone any comments upon it till our next number. We think it would greatly contribute to Dr. Geraghty's letters being generally read if he would either condense or divide his communications.—Ed. C. L.]

TO THE EDITOR OF THE CATHOLIC LAYMAN.

RESPECTED SIR,—We have seen (CATHOLIC LAYMAN, Feb. 18, 1858), how, John xxi., 15, 16, 17, and the first words of Matt. xvi., 18, 19, were understood by SS. Eucherius, Ambrose, Cyprian, &c., and in this, the torrent of the fathers is with them, as will appear by taking their positions on these texts at large.

Tertullian: "Peter, who received the keys of the kingdom of heaven, and the power of loosing and of binding." (De Præscript, n. 22.)

• Phelan and O'Sullivan's "Digest of Evidence," &c.; Commons, 22nd March, 1858. Report, p. 221.

St. Cyprian: "There is one God, and one Christ, and one Church, and one chair founded by the mouth of Christ upon Peter; besides which one altar and one priesthood, no other altar, no new priesthood can be established." (Epist. xliii. Oxon, xl. Benedict.) What St. Cyprian means is this: that if Christ, instead of building, as He did, His Church on one, or on Peter alone, had built it equally on all the Apostles; then, in the event of divisions in the Church (an event which did happen), we might, with an easy conscience, be in the communion of any of the dissentient churches; or, easier still, in the communion of no Church at all; since on this supposition, the Church of C. P. or of Alexandria, or of Rome would all have equal pretensions; but that jarring creeds and communions could constitute the true Church is in flat contradiction to Scripture (John x. 16., *ibid.* xvii. 11, 20, 21, Acts ii. 42, 44), and to the tradition of the Church in all ages.

St. James, Bishop of Nisibis, in Asia, ann. 325: "Simon, head of the Apostles, was by our Lord forgiven, and made the foundation and rock of the Church." (Orat. vii. de Pœnit. tom. v. p. 57, Galland.)

St. Hilary: "Peter, to whom He had given the keys, and on whom He was to build His Church, against which the gates of hell should not prevail." (In Ps. cxxxi.) "Peter's confession was highly recompensed. In thy new nomination, oh, happy foundation of the Church, oh, rock, worthy of the superstructure, which was to baffle the infernal gates, and all the bars of death! Oh, heaven's gate-keeper, to whose discretion are given the keys of eternity." (Comm. in Matt. xvi., n. 7, p. 749.)

St. Cyril of Jerusalem: "Peter, the first of the Apostles, and heaven's key-bearer." (Catech. xvii., n. 27.) "Peter, who carries with him the keys of heaven." (Catech. vi., n. 15.)

St. Ephrem, Syrus: "Lord! to whom didst thou give the heavenly keys? To Bar Jonas, the prince of the Apostles." (T. iii., Syr. Parœn. 33.) "Peter, the keeper of heaven, and the first-born of those that bear the keys." (T. iii., Gr. In. SS. Apost. p. 464.)

St. Gregory of Nyssa: "Through Peter He gave the prelaty the keys of the celestial order." (T. ii. de Castig.) "Peter, the head of the Apostleship, is celebrated; and so are the other members of the Church; yet on him is the Church built; for he is the rock on which the Lord built His Church." (De St. Steph. t. vi. Galland.)

St. Gregory Nazianzen: "Peter, who became the inviolable rock, and who had the keys given to him." (T. ii. Carm. 2 p. 51. *ibid.*) See also t. 1., p. 454. Galland. edit.

St. Macarius of Egypt, an. 325: "To Moses succeeded Peter, who had the new Church of Christ delivered into his hands, and the true priesthood." (Homil. xxvi., p. 101, t. vii. Gal. edit.)

St. Basil the Great: "Peter, who, because of the superiority of his faith, received upon himself the Church's superstructure." (Advers. Eunom. n. 4.) "Peter, who was preferred before all the disciples; who alone received a greater testimony; to whom were given the keys." (T. ii. p. 1. Proœm. de jud. Dei.)

St. Pacian: "The Lord spake to Peter alone, in order that he might lay the foundation of unity from one." (Epist. iii. n. xi. p. 265, t. vii. Galland.)

Marius Victorinus of Africa (Gal. 1, 18): "Paul, to whom all things were revealed, knew that he ought to visit Peter, as him to whom the chief authority had been given by Christ." (T. iii. Script. vit.)

St. Epiphanius: "Peter, who was the prince of the Apostles, who was a firm rock on which is fixed the Lord's faith, on which rock the Church is in every way built; first, in that he confessed Christ, and heard that on this rock of firm faith I will build my Church. Moreover, he also became then the firm rock of the foundation of God's house, in his being, after his conversion, found worthy to hear—"Feed My sheep." (Lib. ii. advers. heres. t. 1, p. 500, a. n., edit. Petav. an. 1622.) "Peter, the prince of the Apostles, to whom were given the keys of the kingdom, is said, Gal. ii. 9." (T. ii. in Anch.)

St. Ambrose: "He said to Peter, 'I prayed for thee that thy faith fail not.' But, to the same Peter He had formerly said—Matt. xvi. 18, 19—How could He not confirm his faith, to whom He gave the kingdom, and whom, when He styles a rock, He pointed out the Church's foundation." (T. ii., lib. iv., de Fide, c. v., p. 531.) "Not of Peter's self, but of his faith was it said, that the gates of hell, &c.; which sentence vanquished hell, and shut out many a heresy; for the Church, being often assailed, must need an invincible basis." (De Incarn. 5.) "To Peter it is said, 'To thee I will give the keys'—the selected one in the apostleship obtained jurisdiction." (Epist. lxxi. ad Horont.)

St. Jerome: "Peter was the prince of the Apostles, on whom, in eternal fixity, the Church of the Lord is built." (Lib. contra. Pelag., n. 14.)

St. Chrysostom: "True, all were Apostles, all were to sit on twelve thrones, &c., still it was the three He took; of which same three He said that some were superior; and He sets Peter before them, saying, 'Lovest thou Me?' &c. Yet John was the well-beloved." (Hom. xxxi. in ep. ad Rom. n. 4.) "And yet in spite of this lapse, He reinstated him, and committed to his hand the supremacy over the universal Church." (T. ii. hom. v. de Pœnit., p. 366, Bened.) "You may ask, why did James

get the see of Jerusalem? I answer, that He made Peter not master of that see, but of the habitable globe." (Hom. lxxxviii. in Joan, n. 6.)

St. Asterius, towards the end of the 4th age: "Isaiah says that the Father laid the Son—the corner stone; meaning that the world has Him for its basis. But the Son nominated Peter to be the Church's foundation: 'Thou art Peter, and on this rock I will build My Church.' Other foundations no man can lay." (1 Cor. iii.) Yet with a like name did our Saviour honour the first of His Apostles: calling him the rock of the faith. Through Peter, then, the permanence of the Church is maintained; and we stand secure on his structure, in spite of the devil and legions of tyrants; as the Word says, 'The floods came, and the winds blew, and it fell not.' Therefore, when God the Saviour ascended into heaven, he, Peter, it was who took up his place; for he ever bore in mind the command given him: Feed my lambs. God endowed none of the disciples with His own gifts like Peter, in placing him, as He did, above all. John reposed on the Lord's breast. James was called the son of thunder; but they must all yield to Peter, and confess that they hold the second place. He everywhere precedes the other disciples. He it was who said, 'Thou art Christ,' &c., and was, therefore, made the Church's foundation; was entrusted with the keys of heaven, and made lord of the gate thereof, and the president of the entrance to the kingdom." (Hom. in Apost. Pet. et Paul.)

St. Prudentius, of the 4th age: "Here are two princes of the Apostles: one, the Apostle of the Gentiles; the other, holding the first chair, opens the gates of eternity that have been entrusted to him." (Hymn. 2, in honor. St. Laurent. t. viii. Galland.)

St. Optatus: "Peter, then, sat first in that very chair which is the chief mark of the Church." (Lib. 2, n. 4.)

St. Augustine: "Peter himself, to whom, bearing a figure of the Church, the Lord says, 'Upon this rock I will build My Church.'" (Epist. liii. a. d. Genesio.) "Peter, on account of the supremacy of his Apostleship, represented the whole Church." (T. iii., p. 2470, Bened.) "Peter! what hast thou left that thou shouldst receive the whole world?" (T. iv., p. 1656, *ibid.*) "Peter, that is, in the order of the Apostles, the chief and the principal." (T. v., p. 597.) "Some things are said respecting Peter which are not clear, except when referred to the Church, of which he is acknowledged to have been the personification on account of his supremacy, such as—"To thee I will give the keys." (T. iv., p. 1733.)

St. Maximus: "Peter, as a shepherd, received the flock to keep, and is called the rock of the Church, as the Lord declares—"Thou art Peter," &c. (Homil. iv., de Petro.) "To Peter was given the helm of the universal Church." (Homil. iii., de Eod. Fest.)

P. Orosius: "O, Peter, on which Christ built His Church, &c., reply to this man. Did Christ say to thee, Pelagius, 'Amen. I say to thee, flesh and blood hath not revealed,' &c.? Did He say to thee, 'Thou shalt be called Cephas?' Did He assure thee, 'On this rock I will build My Church?'" (De lib. arbit., t. vi., Bib. Max. SS. P.P., p. 455-7.)

Zacchæus: "Peter, in whose person is contained the whole ecclesiastic authority, through the Lord's sentence—Matt. xvi. 18, 19." (Lib. ii., consult. Zacch., c. xviii., t. ix., p. 238, Galland.)

St. Cyril of Alexandria: "He changed his name into Peter, from Petra; for on him He was to found His Church" (T. iv., Comm. in Joan., p. 131.)

Theodoret: "Thus did this great basis receive a command to feed the Lord's sheep."

Leo I. of Rome: "Thou art Peter: though I am the inviolable rock—the corner stone, other foundations besides which no man can lay; yet thou also art a rock, 'on which,' says He, 'I will build My Church,' and, because Peter confessed Him, He said to him, 'I will give to thee the keys.' The other Apostles and rulers of the Church were, indeed, sharers in this decree; yet not vainly is that given to one, which may be intimated to all. The Lord says, Luke xxii. 31, 32—In Peter, therefore, they are all strengthened. So that, if things are rightly ordered in our days, it is owing to him the prince of the universal Church, to whom it was said: 'and thou being converted, &c.' and to whom it was said thrice; 'feed my sheep.'" (Serm. lxii. de Pass. Domini.) "To Peter above the rest, by the keys, is the care of the Lord's fold consigned." (Serm. lxxiii. de Ascens. Domini.) "The Lord pleased that his institution should pertain to all the Apostles, so that he lodged it principally in Peter, the chief of the Apostles, and the head, that he who dares to withdraw from the unity of Peter might know himself to be an alien from the divine mystery. For it pleased Him that he whom He had made the centre of unity should be named that which Himself was, in saying, 'Thou art Peter,' &c., that the eternal structure might be embodied in the unity of Peter." (Epist. x. ad Episcop. Viennens.) "The rock of the Catholic faith, which name the Apostle Peter received from the Lord, admits no heresy." (Epist. cxix. ad Max. Antioch.)

Arnobius, junior: "To the penitent Apostle a higher rank was given than he had lost by his fall; for no other apostle received the name of the shepherd; since the Lord